

Spring **1997**

LIBRARY - OTTAWA UNIVERSITY
OTTAWA, KANSAS

82

#3

THE **Forensic** OF PI KAPPA DELTA



**SERIES 82
NO. 3**

PI KAPPA DELTA NATIONAL HONORARY FORENSIC FRATERNITY NATIONAL OFFICERS

Bill Hill, Jr., **President**, University of North Carolina-Charlotte,
Charlotte, North Carolina 28223

Joel Hefling, **President Elect**, South Dakota State University,
Brookings, South Dakota 57007

Robert S. Littlefield, **Secretary Treasurer**, North Dakota State University,
Fargo, North Dakota 58105

Sally Roden, **Past President**, U. of Central Arkansas,
Conway, Arkansas 72032

Steve Hunt, **Editor of the Forensic**, Lewis & Clark College,
Portland, Oregon 97219

Scott Jensen, **Professional Development**, Webster University,
St. Louis, Missouri 63119

Glenda Treadaway, **Tournament Director**, Appalachian State University,
Boone, North Carolina 28606

Jeff Hobbs, **Province Coordinator**, Abilene Christian University,
Abilene, Texas 79699

Rudy Dunlop, **Student Member**, Appalachian State University,
Boone, North Carolina 28606

Lisa Washnock, **Student Member**, Northern Kentucky University,
Highland Heights, Kentucky 41099

R. David Ray, **Historian**, U. of Arkansas-Monticello,
Monticello, Arkansas 71656

PROVINCE GOVERNORS

Lower Mississippi, Kevin Doss, Lamar University at Orange

Great West, Dennis Waller, Northwest Nazarene College

Plains, John McCabe, Bethel College

Southeast, Durrel "Butch" Hamm, Northern Kentucky University

Colonies, Nancy Haga, Longwood College

Lakes, Chris Reynolds, Otterbein College

Missouri, Todd Fuller, Southwest Baptist College

Northern Lights, Stephen Collie, Winona State University

THE FORENSIC of Pi Kappa Delta

Series 82

SPRING, 1997

No. 3

Steve Hunt, Editor
Dept. of Communication
Lewis & Clark College
Portland, OR 97219

REVIEW EDITORS

- Ken Broda-Bahm, Towson State University
- Sam Cox, Central Missouri State University
- Kevin Dean, West Chester University
- C. Thomas Preston, Jr., University of Missouri-St. Louis
- Larry Schnoor, St. Olaf
- Anthony Schroeder, Eastern New Mexico University
- Don Swanson, Monmouth University
- Glenda Treadaway, University of North Carolina-Charlotte
- T.C. Winebrenner, California Polytechnic St.-San Luis Obispo

CONTENTS

Bibliography:

- Select Bibliography for Argumentation and Debate Theory:
 - Part II by Steven B. Hunt1

Fraternal Information:

- President's Corner by Bill Hill22
- Call for Papers by New Editor Mike Bartanen23
- Memories of 1997 PKD Convention and National Tournament
 - Northern Kentucky24
- Critique of 1997 PKD Convention and National Tournament
 - Northern Kentucky by Thomas M. Huebner et al31

Book Reviews:

The Rhetorical Act 2nd ed. by Karlyn Kohrs Campbell

reviewed by Don Swanson

Hate Speech, Rita Kay Whillock and David Slayden, eds.

reviewed by Don Swanson

Liberalism and the Problem of Knowledge:

A New Rhetoric for Modern Democracy

by Charles Arthur Willard, reviewed by James Pickett

Rhetorical Studies of National Political Debates 1960-1992

Robert V. Friedenberg, ed., reviewed by Jason Edwards

Request for Reviews:

Request for Book, Video, and Software Reviews for **The Forensic**

Library Recommendation FormInside Back Cover

Manuscripts/Research Notes/Coaches Corner Materials submitted for review should follow the guidelines of either the MLA Handbook for Writers of Research Papers, 4th edition or the Publications Manual of the American Psychological Association, 6th ed. Three copies of the paper and, if possible, a computer disc showing what word program (preferably Microsoft Word or Word Perfect, either DOS or Mac) the paper was prepared with, should be sent to the editor, Steve Hunt. Other news items and pictures may be mailed to the editor.

THE FORENSIC OF PI KAPPA DELTA (ISSN: 0015-735X) is published four times yearly, Fall, Winter, Spring, and Summer by Pi Kappa Delta Fraternal Society. Subscription price is part of membership dues. For alumni and non-members the rate is \$30.00 for one year, \$60.00 for two years, and \$75.00 for three years. Second Class Postage paid at Fargo, N.D. Postmaster and subscribers: please send all change of address requests to Dr. Robert Littlefield, Dept. of Communication, Box 5075, North Dakota State University, Fargo, N.D. 58105. THE FORENSIC of Pi Kappa Delta is also available on 16 mm microfilm, 35 mm microfilm, or microfiche through University Microfilms International, 300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106.

A SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY ON DEBATE THEORY, PART II

Steve Hunt
Lewis & Clark Clark College

XII. The Affirmative, Comparative Advantage, & Criteria Cases

Brock, Bernard "The Comparative Advantages Case." *Speech Teacher* (March, 1967): 118-123.

Chesebro, James W. "The Comparative Advantage Case." *Jafa* V #2 (Spring, 1968): 57-63.

_____. "Beyond the Orthodox: The Criteria Case." *Jafa* VII (Winter, 1971): 208-215.

Fadely, L. Dean. "The Validity of the Comparative Advantage Case." *Jafa* IV #1 (Winter, 1967): 28-35.

Flanigan, Carl. D. "Concomitant vs Comparative Advantages: Sufficient vs Necessary Conditions." *Jafa* 18 #1 (Summer, 1981): 1-8.

Lewinski, John, Metzler, Bruce, and Settle, Peter L. "The Goal Case Affirmative: An Alternative Approach to Academic Debate." *Jafa* IX (Spring, 1973): 458-463.

Lichtman, Alan; Garvin, Charles; and Corsi, Jerry. "The Alternative Justification Affirmative: A New Case Form." *Jafa* X (Fall, 1973): 59-69.

Ware, B.L., Jr. and English, William B. "A Comparison of the Need Plan and the Comparative Advantage Approach: There is a Difference." *Kansas Speech Journal* (Spring, 1973): 4-11.

Zarefsky, David. "The Traditional Case Comparative Advantage Case Dichotomy: Another Look." *Jafa* 6 #1 (Winter, 1969): 12-20.

_____, ed. *The Comparative Advantage Case*. Championship Debate Enterprises, 1970.

XIII. Negative Approaches to Debate

Brewster, B. "Analysis of Disadvantages: Scenarios and Intrinsicness." *Debaters Research Guide*. Winston Salem, N.C.: Wake Forest University, 1984. Pp. 14-16.

Cragan, John and Shields, Donald. "The Comparative Advantage Negative." *Jafa* 7 #2 (Spring, 1970): 85-91.

Hemmer, Joseph J., Jr. "The Comparative Advantage Negative: An Integrated Approach." *Speaker and Gavel* 13 (Winter, 1976): 27-30.

Hemphill, Dwaine R. "First Negative Strategies: A Reevaluation of Negative Division of Duties." *Argument in Transition: Proceedings of the Third Sum-*

mer Conference on Argumentation. Eds David Zarefsky, Malcolm O. Sillars and Jack Rhodes. Annandale, VA.: SCA, 1983. Pp. 883-892.

Patterson, J.W. "The Obligations of the Negative in a Policy Debate." *The Speech Teacher* (September, 1962): 208-213.

Solt, Roger. "Negative Fiat: Resolving the Ambiguities of Should." *Argumentation and Advocacy* 25 (Winter, 1989): 121-139,.

Thomas, David and Anderson Jerry M. "Negative Approaches to the Comparative Advantages Case." *Speaker and Gavel* (May, 1968): 148-157.

_____. "Response to Cragan and Shields: Alternative Formats for Negative Approaches to Comparative Advantage Cases." *JAF A VIII* (Spring, 1972): 200-206.

Ulrich, Walter. "Debating Generic Disadvantages." *Debate Issues* (Feb., 1985): 14-16.

_____. *Developing and Defending Disadvantages*. Kansas City, MO.: National Federation of State High School Associations, 1993.

XIV. Criteria

Broda-Bahm, Ken. "Community Concepts of Argumentative Legitimacy: Challenging Norms in National-Circuit CEDA Debate." *The Forensic* 79 #3 (Spring, 1994): 26-35.

Brownlee, Don. "Approaches to Support and Refutation of Criteria." *CEDA Yearbook* 1987. Pp. 59-63.

Berube, David. "Parameters for Criteria Debating." *CEDA Yearbook*, 1990. Pp. 9-25.

Cole, Mark; Boggs, Ronald; and Twohy, Kevin. "The Functions of Criteria in Nonpolicy Argumentation: Burdens and Approaches." *CEDA Yearbook* 7, 1986.

XV. Kritiks/Critiques

Bennett, William. "An Introduction to the Kritik." *The Rostrum* (April, 1996): 19-26.

Broda Bahm, Ken. "Meaning as Language Use: The Case of the Language-Linked Value Objection." *CEDA Yearbook* 12, 1991. Pp. 67-78.

_____. and Murphy, Thomas L. "A Defense of Critique Arguments: Beyond the Resolutational Question." *CEDA Yearbook* 15, 1994. Pp. 20-32.

Moris, Eric and Katsulas, John. "Pro and Con: The Relevance Irrelevance of the Critique to Policy Debate." *Forensic Educator* 11 #1 (1996-97)

Roskoski, Matt and Peabody, Joe. "A Linguistic and Philosophic Critique of Language Arguments." Paper presented at the SCA Convention Chicago, IL Nov 1, 1992.

Shanahan, William. "Kritik of Thinking." *Debaters Research Guide* Winston Salem, N.C.: Wake Forest University, 1993. Pp. A3-A8.

Shors, Matthew and Mancuso, Steve. "The Critique: Skreaming Without Raising its Voice." *Debaters Research Guide* Winston Salem, N.C.: Wake Forest University, 1993. Pp. A14-A18.

_____, Roger. *The Anti-Kritik Handbook*. Denton, TX.: Paradigm Research, 1995.

_____. "Demystifying the Critique." *Debaters Research Guide*, Winston Salem, N.C.: Wake Forest University, 1993. Pp. A8-A12.

IV. Topicality

Adams, N. and Wilkins, T. "The Role of Justification in Topic Analysis." *CEDA Yearbook* 7 1987 Pp. 21-26.

Allen, Mike and Burrell, Nancy. "A Pragmatic Theory of Topicality." *Argument and Social Practice: Proceedings of the Fourth Conference on Argumentation*. Eds. Robert J. Cox, Malcolm O. Sillars, and Gregg Walker. Annandale, VA.: SCA, 1985. Pp. 854-861.

Berube, David. "Debating Hasty Generalization." In *Advanced Debate: Readings in Theory, Practice and Teaching*, 3rd ed. Ed. David Thomas and Jack Hart. Lincolnwood, IL.: National Textbook Co., 1987. Pp. 483-489.

_____. "Parametric Topicality: An Analysis and a Rebuttal." *CEDA Yearbook* 12 (1991): 12-26.

_____. "Parametrical Interpretation: Issues and Answers." *Contemporary Argumentation and Debate* 16 (1995) : 30-51.

_____. "What Killed Schrodinger's Cat?: Parametric Topicality, That's What" *CEDA Yearbook* 12 (1991): 12-26.

Bile, Jeffrey. "When the Whole is Greater than the Sum of the Parts: The Implications of Holistic Resolutional Focus." *CEDA Yearbook* 8 (1987) : 8-15.

_____. "Propositional Justification: Another View." *CEDA Yearbook* 9 (1988) 54-62.

Cross, Frank. *Debating Topicality*. San Francisco, CA: Griffin Research, 1987.

Deatherage, Loral and Pfau, Michael. *Arguing Topicality: Perspectives and Techniques*. Kansas City, MO.: National Federation of State High School Associations, 1985.

Dudzak, Craig. "Topicality: An Equal Ground Standard." *CEDA Yearbook* 10 (1989): 12-21.

Hastings, Arthur. "On the Meaning of Should" *Speaker and Gavel* 4 #1 (Nov., 1966): 8-10.

Herbeck, Dale A and Katsulas, John P. "The Affirmative Topicality Burden: Any Reasonable Example of the Resolution." *JAFSA* 21 (Winter, 1985): 133-145.

_____. "The Case Against the Problem Area: A Response to Ulrich." *Forensic Educator* 4 (1989/90): 8-11.

Hingstman, David. "Topicality and Division of Ground." *Framing Policy Dialectic in Argument and Social Practice: Proceedings of the Fourth*

- SCA/AFA Conference on Argumentation. Ed J. Robert Cox, Malcolm O Silars, and Gregg Walker. Annandale, VA.: SCA, 1985. Pp. 841-853.
- Hynes, Thomas J. and Ulrich, Walter. "The Role of Propositions in Forensic Argument." *Argument and Social Practice: Proceedings of the Fourth SCA/AFA Conference on Argumentation*. Ed J. Robert Cox, Malcolm O. Silars, and Gregg Walker. Annandale, VA: SCA, 1985. Pp. 827-840.
- Madsen, Arnie and Loudon, Al. "Jurisdiction and the Evaluation of Topicality." *JAFa* 24 #2 (Fall, 1987): 73-83.
- _____. "The Jurisdiction/Topicality Analogy." *Argumentation and Advocacy* 26 #4 (Spring, 1990): 141-154.
- _____. and Chandler, Robert C. "Further Examination Of Resolutional Focus." *Spheres of Argument: Proceedings of the Sixth SCA/AFA Conference on Argumentation*. Annandale, VA.: SCA, 1989. Pp. 411-416.
- _____. "When the Whole Becomes a Black Hole: Implications of the Holistic Perspective." *CEDA Yearbook* 9 (1988) 30-37.
- McBath, James and Aurbach, Joseph. "Origins of the National Debate Resolution." *JAFa* 4 #3 (Fall, 1967): 96-103.
- Murphy, Thomas L. "Assessing the Jurisdictional Model of Topicality." *Argumentation and Advocacy* 26 (Spring, 1990) 145-150.
- Parson, Donn W. "On Being Reasonable: The Last Refuge of Scoundrels." *Dimensions of Argument: Proceedings of the Second Summer Conference on Argumentation*. Eds George Ziegelmüller and Jack Rhodes. Annandale, VA.: SCA, 1981. Pp. 532-543.
- _____. and Bart, John. "On Being Reasonable: The Last Refuge of Scoundrels Part II: The Scoundrels Strike Back." *Advanced Debate: Readings in Theory, Practice, and Teaching*. Eds. David Thomas and Jack Hart. Lincolnwood, IL.: National Textbook Co., 1989. Pp. 130-138.
- Pfau, Michael. *Arguing Topicality: Perspectives and Techniques*. Kansas City, MO.: National Federation of State High School Associations, 1985.
- Rhodes, Jack and Pfau, Michael. "Resolution of Example: A Reply to Herbeck and Katsulas." *JAFa* XXI (Winter, 1985): 146-149.
- Sherwood, Ken. "Claim Without Warrant: The Lack of Logical Support for Parametric Topicality." *CEDA Yearbook* 15 (1994): 10-19.
- Unger, James. "Topicality: Why not the Best?" *The Rostrum* 56 (Oct, 1981): 5-9.
- Ulrich, Walter. "The Nature of the Problem Area" *Forensic Educator* 4 (1989/90): 5-7.
- _____. "The Nature of the Topic in Value Debate." *CEDA Yearbook* 5 (1988) 1-6.

XVII. Counterplans

- Branham, Robert J. "Roads Not Taken: Counterplans and Opportunity Costs." *Argumentation and Advocacy* 25 (Spring, 1989): 246-255.

- _____. Ed. Special Issue Jafa The State of the Counterplan *Jafa* 25 (Winter, 1989): 117-191.*** This edition is key to modern counterplan theory.***
- Dempsey, Richard H. and Hartmann, David N. "Mirror State Counterplans: Illegitimate, Topical, or Magical?" *Jafa* 22 (Winter, 1985): 161-166.
- Fadley, Dean. "Fiat Power and the Mirror State Counterplan." *Speaker and Gavel* 24 (Winter, 1987): 69-76.
- Gossett, John. "Counterplan Competitiveness in the Stock Issues Paradigm." *Dimensions of Argument: Proceedings of the Second Summer Conference on Argumentation*. Edited George Ziegelmüller and Jack Rhodes. Annandale, VA.: SCA, 1981. Pp. 568-578.
- Herbeck, Dale; Katsulas, John; and Leeper, Karla. "The Locus of Debate Controversy Re-Examined: Implications for Counterplan Theory." *Argumentation and Advocacy* 25 (Winter, 1989): 150-164.
- _____. "A Permutation Standard of Competitiveness." *Jafa* 22 (Summer, 1985): 12-19.
- _____. and Katsulas, John. "Point of Theory: Counterplan Competitiveness." *The Forensic Quarterly* (Fall, 1985): 46-48.
- Hill, Bill. "Counterplans: Requirements, Presumption and Study." *Debate Research Guide*. Winston Salem, N.C.: Wake Forest University, 1980. Pp. 2-7.
- Gynes, Thomas J. Jr. "The Counterplan: An Historical and Descriptive Study." Unpublished M.A. thesis, U of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, 1972.
- _____. *Debating Counterplans*. San Francisco, CA.: Griffin Research, 1987.
- _____. "The Studies Counterplan: Still Hoping- A Reply to Shelton." *Jafa* (Winter, 1985): 156-160.
- Kaplow, Louis. "Rethinking Counterplans: A Reconciliation with Debate Theory." *Jafa* 17 #4 (Spring, 1981): 215-226.
- Katsulas, John; Herbeck, Dale; and Panetta, Edward M. "Fiating Utopia: A Negative View of the Emergence of World Order Counterplans and Futures Gaming in Policy Debate." *Argumentation and Advocacy* 24 (Fall, 1987): 95-111.
- _____. "Fiating Utopia Part Two: A Rejoinder to Edwards and Snider." *Argumentation and Advocacy* 24 (Fall, 1987): 130-136.
- Lane, Gina. "The Justification of Counterplans in Nonpolicy Debate: A Skeptical View." *CEDA Yearbook* 15 (1994) 33-42.
- Lichtman, Allan J and Rohrer, Daniel M. "A General Theory of the Counterplan." *Jafa* 12 (Fall, 1975): 70-79. Classic early article on counterplan theory.
- Madsen, Arnie. "General Systems Theory and Counterplan Competition." *Argumentation and Advocacy* 26 (Fall, 1989): 71-82.
- Mayer, Michael. "Epistemological Considerations of the Studies Counterplan." *Jafa* 19 (Spring, 1983): 261-266.

- _____ and Hale, J. "Evaluating the Studies Counterplan: Topicality and Competitiveness." *Speaker and Gavel* 16 (Summer, 1979): 67-72.
- Nebergall, Roger E. "The Negative Counterplan." *Speech Teacher* 6 (Sept., 1957): 217-220.
- Panetta, Edward M. and Dolley, Steven. "The Topical Counterplan: A Competitive Policy Option." *Argumentation and Advocacy* 25 (Winter, 1989): 165-177.
- Perkins, Dallas. "Counterplans and Paradigms." *Argumentation and Advocacy* 25 #3 (Winter, 1989): 140-149.
- Shelton, Michael W. "In Defense of the Study Counterplan." *JAFSA* 21 (Winter, 1985): 150-155.
- Solt, Roger. "Counterplan Competition: Permutations and Beyond." *Debaters Research Guide*, Winston Salem, N.C.: Wake Forest University, 1985. Pp. 18-23.
- Thompson, Wayne N. "The Effect of the Counterplan Upon the Burden of Proof." *Central States Speech Journal* 13 (Autumn, 1962): 247-252.
- Ulrich, Walter. "The Legitimacy of the Counter Procedure Counterplan." *JAFSA* 23 (Winter, 1987): 166-169.
- _____. *Understanding the Counterplan*. Kansas City, MO.: National Federation of State High School Associations, 1986.
- Unger, James. "Investigating the Investigators: A Study of the Study Counterplan." *Debate Issues* 12 (Feb., 1979): 1-8.
- Walker, Gregg B. "The Counterplan as Argument in Non-Policy Debate." *Argumentation and Advocacy* 25 (Winter, 1989): 178-191.

XVIII. Counterwarrants

- Ganer, Patricia. "Counterwarrants: An Idea Whose Time Has Not Come." *Dimensions of Argument: Proceedings of the Second Summer Conference on Argumentation*. Ed. George Ziegelmüller and Jack Rhodes. Annandale, VA.: SCA, 1981. Pp. 478-484.
- Hunt, Steven B., and Tolbert, Greg. "Counter-Warrants: A Method for Testing Topical Justification in CEDA Debate." *CEDA Yearbook* (1985): 21-28.
- Keeshan, Marjorie, and Ulrich, Walter. "Critique of the Counter-Warrant as a Negative Strategy." *JAFSA* 16 #3 (Winter, 1980): 199-203.
- Mayer, Michael. "Extending Counter-Warrants: The Counter Resolutional Counterplan." *JAFSA* 19 (Fall, 1982): 122-127.
- Paulsen, James W. and Rhodes, Jack. "The Counter-Warrant as a Negative Strategy: A Modest Proposal." *JAFSA* 15 (Spring, 1979): 205-210. This is the article that started counterwarrant theory.
- Rhodes, Jack. "A Defense of the Counter-Warrant as Negative Argument." *Dimensions of Argument: Proceedings of the Second Summer Conference on Argumentation*. Eds. George Ziegelmüller and Jack Rhodes. Annandale, VA.: SCA, 1981. Pp. 485-493.